





4. The presiding judge at Mr. Cummings' trial was the Honorable Doug Gabbard, II.
5. Mr. Cummings is currently in custody at the H-Unit, Oklahoma State Penitentiary, P.O. Box 97, McAlester, Oklahoma 74502.

There are no criminal matters pending in other courts against Mr. Cummings, nor is there any sentence, capital or non-capital, to be served by Mr. Cummings in any other jurisdiction.

### I. Capital Offense Information

6. Mr. Cummings was convicted of two counts of Murder in the first degree, 21 O.S.1991, §701.7, with a sentence of death imposed on each count.

The aggravating factors alleged in the Bill of Particulars (OR 207) are:

Count I, the homicide of Judy Moody Mayo: the existence of a probability that the defendant would commit criminal acts of violence that would constitute a continuing threat to society. COUNT I WAS REVERSED WITH THE INSTRUCTION DISMISSED BY THE OKLAHOMA COURT OF APPEALS ON DIRECT APPEAL, AUGUST 4, 1998

Count II, the homicide of Melissa Moody: (1) the existence of a probability that the defendant would commit criminal acts of violence that would constitute a continuing threat to society, and (2) the murder was committed for the purpose of avoiding arrest or prosecution. IF 2 WAS DISMISSED BY THE OKLAHOMA CRIMINAL COURT OF APPEALS AUGUST 4, 1998 ON DIRECT APPEAL

The aggravating factors found by the jury were the same as those alleged in the Bill of Particulars.

Mitigating factors listed in the jury instructions (OR 465) that jurors could consider were, *inter alia*, the following:

Mr. Cummings has been an exemplary prisoner while incarcerated.  
Mr. Cummings has a family that loves and cares for him.  
There are others more morally culpable for these crimes.  
There is a residual doubt as to the guilt of Mr. Cummings.  
Mr. Cummings has performed acts of kindness to friends and family.  
Mr. Cummings has had an impoverished and deprived background.

Victim Impact Evidence was not introduced at Mr. Cummings' trial.

7. The finding of guilty was made after a plea of "not guilty" by Mr. Cummings.
8. Mr. Cummings was found guilty by a jury.



9. The two death sentences were determined by a jury.

## II. Non-capital Offense Information

10. A Second Amended Felony Information charged Count III, Child Abuse (OR 290). The trial court dismissed Count III at the close of the State's case (T. 855-56), because there was no evidence to corroborate the testimony of co-defendant Juanita Cummings in support of Count III.
11. No finding of guilt was made on the non-capital charge.
12. The non-capital charge was not submitted to the jury.

## III. Case Information

13. Mr. Cummings, who was indigent, was represented by court-appointed counsel in the trial court. The names and addresses of his trial attorneys are as follows:

Paul S. Faulk  
Capital Trial Division  
Oklahoma Indigent Defense System  
P.O. Box 926  
Norman, OK 73070-0926

Joseph O. Minter V  
P.O. Box 370  
Madill, OK 73446

14. Lead counsel was appointed by the trial court. Co-counsel was selected by lead counsel and contracted with by the State through the Oklahoma Indigent Defense System's Capital Trial Division, with a \$5000 cap on compensation paid to co-counsel.
15. Mr. Cummings has appealed his convictions to this Court, Case No. F-96-657.

**Appellant's Brief** was filed on July 7, 1997.

The State, through the office of the Attorney General, filed **Brief of Appellee** on November 3, 1997.

A **Reply Brief** was filed on behalf of Mr. Cummings on November 24, 1997.

**Oral Argument** was presented to this Court on March 10, 1998.

To date Mr. Cummings' direct appeal case has not been remanded to the District Court for an evidentiary hearing. An **Application for an Evidentiary Hearing**, alleging facts in support of a claim of ineffective assistance of trial counsel, was filed by appellate counsel on July 7, 1997. That motion is presently pending before this Court.



16. Mr. Cummings' direct appeal counsel is:

William H. Luker  
Capital Direct Appeals Division  
Oklahoma Indigent Defense System  
1660 Cross Center Drive  
Norman, Oklahoma 73019

17. No opinion has been issued; Mr. Cummings' direct appeal is presently pending before this Court.
18. No further review has been sought at this time, pending decision of this Court on the direct appeal and this Original Application for Post-Conviction Relief.

**Part B: Grounds For Relief**

19. A motion for discovery is being filed with this Application (*see* Addendum B). In addition, Mr. Cummings has filed two pending discovery motions with this Court, to wit:
- Motion to View Evidence Relevant to Innocence in the Possession of the OSBI, filed on February 2, 1998.
- Motion to Produce Brady Evidence Relevant to Innocence, filed on March 23, 1998.
20. A motion for evidentiary hearing is being filed with this Application (*see* Addendum B).
21. The other motions filed prior to the filing of this Application are:
- Petitioner's Motion for Extension of Time for Filing an Original Application for Post-Conviction Relief, filed on February 13, 1998, and which was granted by Order of this Court dated March 2, 1998.
- Joint Motion to Substitute Petitioner's Correct Name, Mr. J. Cummings, and to Strike by Interlineation the Incorrect Named Used in These Proceedings, filed on February 18, 1998.
- Petitioner's Motion for Extension of Time for Filing An Original Application for Post-Conviction Relief, filed on March 11, 1998, and which was granted by Order of this Court dated March 26, 1998.
22. The propositions raised in this Application are set forth in the Claims for Relief below, and are listed in the following Table of Contents.



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Part A: Procedural History	i
Part B: Grounds for Relief	iv
Table of Contents	v
Appendix: Table of Contents	viii
Abbreviations and References to the Record	xi
<b>Averment of Preliminary Facts in Support of Application</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>A. Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>B. Jessie Cummings is Factually Innocent of These Offenses</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>C. The Wives were not Battered Women and They did not Act out of Duress</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>D. Information about the Victims Needed to Understand this Case</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>E. Information about Jessie Cummings Needed to Understand this Case</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>F. Sherry Cummings: The Dominate Person in the Cummings' Household</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>G. Anita Cummings: The Person Who Shot and Killed Judy</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>H. Lahoma Yaws: The False Rape Allegation Invented to Help her Sister</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>I. Knowledge about the White Trash Sub-Culture is Needed to Understand this Case</b>	<b>29</b>
<b>J. Events Preceding the Offense</b>	<b>34</b>
<b>K. The Offenses and Discovery of the Bodies in 1991</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>L. Subsequent Events Prior to the Arrests</b>	<b>54</b>
<b>M. The July 1994 Arrests</b>	<b>58</b>
<b>N. Relevant Procedural History of the Case</b>	<b>71</b>
<b><u>Proposition 1:</u></b>	<b>79</b>
Mr. Cummings is Factually and Legally Innocent of these Offenses.	
<b><u>Proposition 2:</u></b>	<b>87</b>
Mr. Cummings Has Been Denied the Effective Assistance of Counsel in All Prior Proceedings.	



<b><u>Proposition 3:</u></b>	113
Misconduct by the Prosecution in Using False Evidence and in Suppressing Material Evidence Denied Mr. Cummings a Fair Trial	
<b><u>Proposition 4:</u></b>	120
Mr. Cummings Was Denied a Fair and Reliable Determination of the Appropriate Sentence in this Case, and the Evidence is Insufficient to Support the Aggravating Circumstances.	
<b><u>Proposition 5:</u></b>	129
Fundamental Errors in the Jury Instructions Denied Mr. Cummings a Fair Trial and a Reliable Determination of the Appropriate Sentence.	
<b><u>Proposition 6:</u></b>	136
Acts and Omissions of the Trial Court Denied Mr. Cummings his Fundamental Rights, a Fair Trial and a Fair and Reliable Determination of the Appropriate Sentence.	
<b><u>Proposition 7:</u></b>	139
Mr. Cummings' Jury Was Improperly Constituted Which Is a Structural Error Requiring Reversal and a New Trial	
<b><u>Proposition 8:</u></b>	140
Mr. Cummings is Being Denied an Adequate Appellate and Corrective Collateral Review Process.	
<b><u>Proposition 9:</u></b>	146
Mr. Cummings is Being Denied a Fair and Adequate Clemency Process.	
<b><u>Proposition 10:</u></b>	148
The Death Penalty Constitutes Unnecessary Cruel and/or Unusual Punishment.	
<b><u>Proposition 11</u></b>	161
The Cumulative Effect of the Errors Violating Mr. Cummings' Rights Constitutes a Denial of Due Process and Fundamental Fairness.	



APPENDIX

Request for Relief	163
Certificate of Service	164
Verification	165
Addendum A: <b>Statement of Arguments and Authorities in Support of Application for Post-Conviction Relief</b>	
Addendum B: <b>Motion for Evidentiary Hearing, Motion for Leave to Conduct Discovery, and Motion to Supplement the Record</b>	
Addendum C: <b>Motion to Keep the Record Open</b>	



## APPENDIX

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

- Appendix 1. Judgment and sentence of the District Court.
- Appendix 2. Death Warrant.
- Appendix 3. District Court's determination of indigence.  
No material changes in Petitioner's indigence status have occurred since the original determination was made.
- Appendix 4. Affidavit of Dr. Wayne Flynt, Ph.D., dated April 23, 1998.
- Appendix 5. Affidavit of Dr. Ray Hand, Ph.D., dated July 1, 1997.
- Appendix 6. Affidavit of Dr. Ray Hand, Ph.D., dated April 20, 1998.
- Appendix 7. Affidavit of Judith G. Menadue, dated April 27, 1994.
- Appendix 8. Affidavit of Kevin H. Pate, dated April 27, 1994.
- Appendix 9. Photos of house in Phillips, OK, and layout of rooms inside the house.
- Appendix 10. Photos of Jessie, Anita, Sherry, Shirley, and family members.
- Appendix 11. Alleged Sequence of Events, based on Anita & Sherry Cummings' trial testimony
- Appendix 12. Jessie Cummings' Family Tree
- Appendix 13. Sherry Cummings' Family Tree
- Appendix 14. Medical Examiner's Report regarding the autopsy of Judy Mayo
- Appendix 15. Medical Examiner's Report regarding the autopsy of Melissa Moody
- Appendix 16. Comparison on Anita Cummings Statements which Show the Evolution of Her Embellishments.
- Appendix 17. Information regarding police interrogations of Anita Cummings
- Appendix 18. Taped Statement of Anita Cummings dated July 29, 1994.
- Appendix 19. Taped Statement of Anita Cummings dated July 30, 1994.



- Appendix 20. Information regarding **Sherry Mitchell Cummings**
- Appendix 21. Information regarding police interrogations of **Sherry Cummings**
- Appendix 22. Taped Statement of **Sherry Cummings** dated July 30, 1994.
- Appendix 23. Information regarding police interrogations of **Jessie Cummings**
- Appendix 24. False confession by **Jessie Cummings** dated July 30, 1994.
- Appendix 25. Information regarding **Diane Fields**
- Appendix 26. Information regarding **Eddie Fields**
- Appendix 27. Information regarding **Timothy Chancellor**
- Appendix 28. Information regarding **Daniel Franklin Chick**
- Appendix 29. Information regarding **Robert Cogburn**
- Appendix 30. Information regarding **Edna Horn** and phone bill
- Appendix 31. Information regarding **Stella Knight**
- Appendix 32. Information regarding **Eugene Mayo**
- Appendix 33. Information regarding **Loretta Lynne McCullar** [formerly **Wells**]
- Appendix 34. Information regarding **James Moody**, son of **Judy Mayo**
- Appendix 35. Information regarding **Ella Faye Potter**
- Appendix 36. Information regarding **Anita's** correspondence to **Michael Williams**
- Appendix 37. Information regarding **Lahoma Yaws**
- Appendix 38. computer print out of **Incident Report** filed in **Batesville, AR**, regarding allegations that **Lahoma Yaws** had been sexually abused by her mother's live-in boyfriend, **Clarence David Potter**.
- Appendix 39. **Missing Person** reports filed in **Coal County** September 8 & 9, 1991.
- Appendix 40. **Missing Person** report filed in **Atoka County**, September 8, 1991.
- Appendix 41. Information regarding **luminol testing**.
- Appendix 42. Miscellaneous **OSBI** and law enforcement records



- Appendix 43. *In the Matter of the Adoption of Robbie Jewel Glen Lewis, a Minor Child*, Coal County District Court, Case No. AD 93-2.  
Home Visit Report [adoption file]
- Appendix 44. *In the Matter of Debra Cummings, Ashley Cummings and Robbie Lewis, Deprived Children*, District Court of Coal County, No. JFJ 94-11.
- Appendix 45. Social Security Disability records regarding Mr. Cummings
- Appendix 46. Jessie J. Cummings' medical records
- Appendix 47. Jesse S. Cummings' medical records
- Appendix 48. Jessie Cummings' DOC Field Jacket
- Appendix 49. Information about botched executions by lethal injection
- Appendix 50. newspaper articles
- Appendix 51. transcript of Jessie Cummings' notebooks (Exhibit 27 at trial)
- Appendix 52. Transcript of plea of guilty and sentencing on May 24, 1996, , *State v. Juanita Cummings*, Coal County District Court, CF 94-34.
- Appendix 53. Transcript of plea of guilty and sentencing on May 20, 1996, , *State v. Sherry Cummings*, Coal County District Court, CF 94-33.
- Appendix 54. Emergency Custody Orders in District Court of Coal County, Nos. CV 94-12 & 94-13.
- Appendix 55. Newspaper articles regarding the Governor's prejudging clemency petitions



## ABBREVIATIONS AND REFERENCES TO THE RECORD

The record and transcripts in this case will be referred to using the following abbreviations followed by the applicable page number(s) in parenthesis:

App. Brief	Appellant's Brief filed in this Court on July 7, 1997, in Case No. F 96-657.
Appellee's Brief	Brief of Appellee filed by the Attorney General in this Court on November 3, 1997, in Case No. F 96-657.
Disclaimer	The Disclaimer filed by Appellant in this Court on July 7, 1997, in Case No. F 96-657.
O.R.	the two volumes of the Original Record in Case No. CF 94-32.
PH-I	the transcript of the first Preliminary Hearing held on November 28, 1994, and continued on December 8, 1994.
PH-II	the transcript of the second Preliminary Hearing held on April 9, 1996.
T.	the four volumes of transcripts of the jury trial held on May 6 -9, 1996.

The following abbreviations are used herein:

Application	the instant Verified Original Application for Post-Conviction Relief
BWS	Battered Woman Syndrome
LWOP	The sentence of Life Without Parole